

THE NEW YORK CITY LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION 1 CENTRE STREET 9TH FLOOR NORTH NEW YORK NY 10007 TEL: 212 669-7700 FAX: 212 669-7780



PERMIT

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

ISSUE DATE: 12/23/20	EXPIRATION DATE: 4/16/2025		DOCKET #: LPC-21-00381	C	COFA COFA-21-00381
ADDRESS: 36-38 WEST 8TH STREET		BOROUGH: MANHATTAN		BLOCK/LOT: 553 / 24	
Greenwich Village Historic District					

Display This Permit While Work Is In Progress

ISSUED TO:

Joseph S. Straus Straus Group/Clinton Eight Realty LLC 173 Bridge Plaza North Fort Lee, NJ 07024

NOT ORIGINAL
COMPUTER-GENERATED COPY

Pursuant to Section 25-307 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, at the Public Meeting of April 16, 2019, following the Public Hearing and Public Meeting of February 5, 2019, voted to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work at the subject premises, as put forth in your application completed on January 10, 2019, and as you were notified in Status Update Letter 19-34417 and Status Update Letter 19-34933, issued on April 17, 2019.

The proposal, as approved, consists of demolishing the existing one-story commercial buildings at 36-38 West 8th Street (aka 181 MacDougal Street) and 179 MacDougal Street (aka 40-44 West 8th Street), and constructing a new residential building with a commercial ground floor, expressed as two buildings, consisting of six-story corner building fronting West 8th Street and MacDougal Street, featuring a patterned beige brick facade, corbelled brick cornices with cast stone coping, punched window openings with cast stone sills, and gray-finished two-over-two metal windows in single and paired configurations; gray-finished metal storefront infill at the ground floor, featuring paneled bulkheads, large arched display windows framed by fluted colonettes, entrance doors with arched transoms and sidelights, and flat signbands; a chamfered corner entrance with a gray-finished fluted metal support column; and a gray-finished metal egress door at the westernmost bay; a seven-story building fronting MacDougal Street, featuring a patterned red brick

Page 1Issued: 12/23/20

DOCKET #: LPC-21-00381

facade with corbelled brick cornice, large window bays with bullnose brick sills, and brown-finished oneover-one metal window assemblies: bronze-finished metal storefront and entrance infill at the ground floor. featuring paired entrance doors, marquee, large display window, and paneled piers, bulkheads and signband; brick rear facade with punched openings, sliding door assemblies, and metal balconies; a roof terrace at the 6th floor; one-story setback penthouse with zinc cladding and metal and glass window and door assemblies at the 6th floor roof; mechanical equipment, elevator and stair bulkheads with gray-finished metal cladding, and metal mesh guardrails at the 7th floor roof. The proposal, as initially presented, included additional spandrel bands at the upper floors, different proportions at the ground floor bays, more simply-designed storefront infill at both buildings, and a thicker marquee at the MacDougal Street entrance. The proposal, as approved, was shown in a digital presentation, titled "Landmarks Preservation Commission Design Presentation," dated April 16, 2019, and including twenty-nine (29) slides. The proposal, as initially presented, was shown in a digital presentation, titled "Landmarks Preservation Commission Design Presentation," dated February 5, 2019, and including fifty-two (52) slides. Both presentations were prepared by Morris Adjmi Architects and Higgins & Quasebarth Partners, LLC, and consisted of photographs, drawings, and renderings, all of which was presented as components of the application at the Public Hearing and Public Meetings.

In reviewing this proposal, the Commission noted that the Greenwich Village Historic District Designation report describes 36-38 West 8th Street as a one-story commercial building designed by Leon & Levy and built in 1937; and 179 MacDougal Street as a one-story commercial building designed by H.I. Feldman and built in 1937. The Commission further noted that the adjacent blocks on West 8th Street and MacDougal Streets feature an eclectic variety of building heights, types, and styles, including 19th century rowhouses with altered commercial bases, and 20th century loft and apartment buildings.

With regard to this proposal, the Commission found that the existing one-story commercial buildings have been significantly altered prior to, and since designation, and therefore their demolition will not detract from the special historic and architectural character of the Greenwich Village Historic District; that the massing and height of the proposed new building, externally expressed as two buildings of six and seven stories in height, will relate respectively to the streetscapes of West 8th Street and MacDougal Street, which feature a variety of building heights; that the proposed facades are articulated in a tri-partite arrangement of base, shaft and capital, recalling the typical facade composition of the tall apartment and loft buildings located throughout this historic district; that the proposed materials palette, featuring red and beige brick and cast stone, and grey and brown metal windows, will harmonize with the masonry materials and finishes of buildings found throughout this historic district; that the proposed detailing at the façades, featuring ornamental brickwork laid in a variety of patterns and corbelled modular brick cornices, will provide a level of depth and articulation comparable to what is found on historic buildings within this district, while contributing to the building's contemporary design; that the fenestration pattern at the MacDougal Street façade, featuring large window bays separated by brick spandrels, will recall the façade composition of neighboring loft buildings; that the fenestration pattern at the West 8th Street façade, composed of paired and single window bays, will reference the proportions of repeating bays that are characteristic of 20th century apartment buildings, and serve to break up the masonry expanse of the façade; that the design, configuration, and materials of the ground floor infill, featuring a corner storefront entrance, large glazed display windows with metal framing, metal bulkheads, paired entry doors, and metal signbands with pinmounted metal signage, will harmonize with the ground floor treatments of buildings within the streetscape; that the proposed metal marquee at the MacDougal Street entrance will be finished to match the surrounding infill and be well integrated with the design of the façade, helping it to remain a discreet presence within the streetscape; that the grey metal and glass-clad rooftop penthouse, stair and elevator bulkheads, metal mesh railings, and mechanical equipment set behind a louvered screen, while visible from several vantage points, will be simple in design and silhouette, and comparable to rooftop accretions found on other large buildings throughout this historic district; that the rear facade will feature a high solid to void ratio, with simply

designed fenestration pattern and color palette that will be in keeping with typical rear facades of buildings within this historic district; and that the resulting building will enhance the special architectural character of the Greenwich Village Historic District. Based on these findings, the Commission determined the work to be appropriate to the building and the historic district and voted to approve the application.

The Commission authorized the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness upon receipt, review and approval of signed and sealed Department of Building filing drawings showing the approved design.

Subsequently, on July 15, 2020 and December 21, 2020, the Commission received sets of the final Department of Buildings filing drawings, labeled T-000.00, G-001.00 through G-007.00, Z-001.00 through Z-005.00, EN-001.00 through EN-009.00, EG-001.00, EG-002.00, A-001.00, A-111.00, A-112.00, A-101.00 through A-108.00, A-121.00 through A-127.00, A-203.00 through A-205.00, A-301.00 through A-303.00, A-313.00, A-321.00, A-401.00 through A-404.00, A-440.00, A-451.00, A-471.00, A-472.00, A-480.00, A-481.00, A-490.00, A-491.00, A-501.00 through A-504.00, A-511.00, A-521.00, A-801.00 through A-803.00, A-811A.00, A-811B.00, A-812.00, A-813.00, A-825.00, and A-871.00, dated August 17, 2020; drawings A-201.00, A-202.00, A-311.00, A-312.00, A-322.00 through A-324.00, A-371.00, A-372.00, A-380.00, A-381.00, A-410.00, A-420.00, A-452.00, A-460.00, A-470.00, and A-821.00, dated December 18, 2020, prepared by Morris Adimi, R.A.; drawings BPP-001.00 through BPP-003.00, dated August 3, 2020, prepared by Mark B. Sullivan, R.A.; drawings FO-001.00, FO-100.00, FO-101.00, FO-301.00, FO-501.00, S-001.00, S-102.00 through S-110.00, S-401.00, S-501.00 through S-503.00, and S-601.00, April 23, 2020, prepared by Scott E. Hughes, P.E.; drawings M-001.00 through M-004.00, M-100.00 through M-106.00, M-201.00, M-202.00, M-301.00 through M-304.00, M-401.00 through M-403.00, dated April 23, 2020; drawings EN-010.00 through EN-012.00, EN-100.00 through EN-106.00, P-001.00, P-002.00, EN-016.00, EN-017.00, P-099.00, P-100.00 through P-106.00, P-201.00 through P-205.00, P-301.00 through P-304.00, SP/SD-001.00 through SP/SD-003.00, SP/SD-100.00 through SP/SD-106.00, SP/SD-201.00, SP/SD-202.00, FA-001.00 through FA-003.00, and FA-100.00 through FA-106.00, dated June 30, 2020, prepared by Alex B. Schwartz, P.E.; drawings SOE-001.00, SOE-100.00 through SOE-102.00, SOE-200.00 through SOE-202.00, and SOE-300.00, dated May 1, 2020, prepared by Nidal M. Abi Saab, P.E.; demolition drawings for 38 West 8th Street, labeled DM-001.00, DM-002.00, DM-100.00 through DM-100.00 through DM-114.00, DM-200.00, DM-201.00, and DM-300.00, dated April 22, 2020, prepared by Santiago E. Helman, P.E.; demolition drawings for 40 West 8th Street, labeled DM-001.00, DM-002.00, DM-100.00 through DM-100.00 through DM-114.00, DM-200.00, DM-201.00, and DM-300.00, dated April 22, 2020, prepared by Santiago E. Helman, P.E.; as well as a Department of Buildings lot merger application, dated September 17, 2018 and prepared by Morris Adjmi, R.A.; photographic survey reports of adjacent buildings, dated September 4, 2020, prepared by RA Engineering; existing sidewalk photographs; a presentation titled "Rooftop Mechanical Layout," dated August 23, 2020, prepared by Morris Adjmi Architects; a presentation titled "LPC Approved North Elevation w/ Overlay of Proposed Adjustments, dated August 28, 2020, prepared by Morris Adjmi Architects; a letter dated July 15, 2020, prepared by Graeme Sowerby/Morris Adjmi Architects; and email correspondence dated August 31, 2020 and October 8, 2020, prepared by Jonathan Taylor/Higgins Ouasebarth & Partners.

Accordingly, the Commission staff reviewed these materials and noted that they include changes to the approved scope of work, including revising the operation of the upper floor windows to casement windows, in lieu of double-hung; minor dimensional modifications to components of the corner building façades, including cornice projection above the ground floor, pier widths, and window sill depths; revising the storefront infill configuration at the westernmost bay at the West 8th Street façade to one large display window and entrance, in lieu of a central entrance flanked by two smaller display windows; installing perforated metal grilles above the storefronts in lieu of solid metal signbands; adding paneled bases at the storefront doors, to match the display window bulkheads; installing gray-finished standing seam metal cladding at the penthouse in lieu of zinc cladding; modifications to fenestration at the penthouse facades,

including creating additional openings and installing a combination of picture windows and paired doors, in lieu of sliding doors; and modifications to the layout of mechanical equipment at the roof. Staff also noted that these materials include additional work, including an application to the Department of Buildings to merge tax lots 21 and 24; excavation to construct a cellar level; the installation of an outdoor kitchen and built-in planters at the penthouse terrace; and at the West 8th Street and MacDougal Street sidewalks and corner, removing existing untinted concrete paving and installing bluestone-tinted concrete paving scored to match the neighboring concrete scoring at West 8th Street and MacDougal Streets, three (3) tree pits, and a pedestrian ramp at the corner.

With regards to these changes and this additional work, the Commission found that certain aspects of the work are in accordance with the provisions set forth in Title 63 of the Rules of the City of New York. Section 2-15 for Rooftop and Rear Yard Additions or Enlargements, including Section 2-15(d)(2) for nonoccupiable rooftop additions on buildings in a historic district; and Section 2-19 for Sidewalks, including Section 2-19(c) for replacement of existing non-bluestone sidewalk, and Section 2-19(g)(1) for pedestrian ramps at sidewalk intersections. Furthermore, with regard to these or other aspects of the work, the Commission found that the revised window operation will utilize a traditional operation type and will retain a four-light configuration, therefore referencing the operation and configuration of windows commonly found at nineteenth and early-twentieth century buildings within the district; that the configuration of the westernmost storefront bay at the West 8th Street facade will recall the configuration of the easternmost storefront bay, thereby reinforcing the symmetry of the ground floors; that the façade elements at the corner building are not significant in dimension, and will maintain the building's overall detailing, articulation, and proportions; that the metal grilles at the storefront signbands will conceal ventilation louvers behind, and will allow for the installation of pin-mounted signage, and are in keeping with typical modifications to storefront infill found throughout the district; that the installation of paneled bases to the storefront doors will maintain a consistent treatment across the ground floor infill; that the changes at the setback penthouse will be minimally perceptible and will not call undue attention to themselves nor result in additional visibility. Additionally, the Commission found that the design approved by the Commission has been maintained. Based on these and the above findings, the drawings have been marked approved and Certificate of Appropriateness 21-00381 is being issued.

The approved documents, and Department of Buildings filing drawings where applicable, are marked approved by the Commission, with the date of the approval indicated.

SHOP DRAWINGS REQUIRED: Pursuant to Title 63 of the Rules of the City of New York, Section 2-11(b)(6) for Repair, Restoration, Replacement and Re-creation of Building Façades and Related Exterior Elements, this permit is being issued contingent upon the Commission's review and approval of shop drawings for the MacDougal street marquee, and perforated metal grilles at the storefronts, prior to the commencement of work. Digital copies of all shop drawings may be sent to efagan@lpc.nyc.gov for review.

PLEASE NOTE: As the approved work consists of subsurface work, the applicant is required to strictly adhere to all Department of Buildings' requirements for in-ground construction at, and adjacent to, historic buildings, including, when required, TPPN 10/88 monitoring.

Please see Title 63 of the Rules of the City of New York for complete text of any cited Rule section(s): http://www1.nyc.gov/site/lpc/applications/rules-guides.page

This permit is issued on the basis of the building and site conditions described in the application and disclosed during the review process. By accepting this permit, the applicant agrees to notify the Commission if the actual building or site conditions vary or if original or historic building fabric is discovered. The Commission reserves the right to amend or revoke this permit, upon written notice to the applicant, in the

event that the actual building or site conditions are materially different from those described in the application or disclosed during the review process.

The approved documents, and Department of Buildings filing drawings where applicable, are marked as approved by the Commission, with the date of the approval indicated. The work is limited to what is contained in the approved documents and referenced in the approval. Other work or amendments to this filing must be reviewed and approved separately. The applicant is hereby put on notice that performing or maintaining any work not explicitly authorized by this permit may make the applicant liable for criminal and/or civil penalties, including imprisonment and fine. This letter constitutes the permit; a copy must be prominently displayed at the site while work is in progress. Please direct inquiries to Elizabeth Fagan.

Sarah Carroll Chair

PLEASE NOTE: APPROVED DOCUMENTS, DEPARTMENT OF BUIDINGS FILING DRAWINGS WHERE APPLICABLE, AND A COPY OF THIS PERMIT HAVE BEEN PROVIDED TO:

Jonathan Taylor, Higgins Quasebarth & Partners

cc: Edith Bellinghausen, Deputy Director; Jonathan Taylor, Higgins Quasebarth & Partners

Page 5
Issued: 12/23/20
DOCKET #: LPC-21-00381